



# A Literature Review on the Impact of Legal Reforms on Administrative Efficiency in Local Governments

Wahyu Pramono<sup>1\*</sup>, Berian Hariadi<sup>2</sup>, Rizki Afri Mulia<sup>3</sup>, Rianda Prima Putri<sup>4</sup>, Susiyanti Meilina<sup>5</sup>, Suryaningsih<sup>6</sup>

<sup>1</sup>Department of Sociology, Faculty of Social and Political Science, Universitas Andalas, Indonesia

<sup>2,3,5</sup>Department of Public Administration, STISIP Imam Bonjol, Padang, Indonesia

<sup>4,6</sup>Department of Government Science, STISIP Imam Bonjol, Padang, Indonesia

\* Corresponding author: wahyu.pramonopd2@gmail.com

## ARTICLE INFO

### Article history:

Received 01 April 2024

Received in revised form 27

May 2024

Accepted 29 May 2024

## ABSTRACT

This research paper offers an extensive literature review concerning the effects of legal alterations on the operational efficiency of municipal administrations. Despite implementing numerous legislative modifications to improve administrative efficacy, many local governing bodies encounter obstacles such as bureaucratic procedures, corruption, and insufficient institutional capabilities. Successful instances in nations like South Korea and Singapore underscore the significance of digitalization within public administration and unwavering political dedication in overcoming these hindrances and bolstering transparency. Conversely, in regions such as India and various African countries, obstacles like institutional shortcomings and widespread corruption hinder the effectiveness of reform initiatives. Critical elements for the success of such reforms encompass institutional capacity, political backing, and the integration of information and communication technologies. Public involvement and the effective management of bureaucratic opposition are also paramount. This analysis furnishes valuable insights for policymakers and scholars aiming to devise and execute more effective legal reforms. Policy recommendations entail continual training for governmental officials, persistent political dedication, and customized strategies tailored to local reform implementation obstacles.

### Keyword:

Legal Reform, Administrative Efficiency, Local Government Literature Review.

## INTRODUCTION

Administrative effectiveness within regional governance plays a crucial role in

shaping the standard of public services and the well-being of the public (Mulia &

<sup>1</sup>wahyu.pramonopd2@gmail.com

Saputra, 2020; Song et al., 2021). A proficient governance body can efficiently allocate resources, minimize operational expenses, and enhance public contentment with the services rendered (White, 2001). Over the past few decades, numerous nations have implemented legislative alterations with the aim of enhancing administrative effectiveness across different governmental tiers. These legislative alterations encompass modifications in the regulatory structure, administrative protocols, and heightened levels of transparency and answerability (Karkin & Janssen, 2020; Kysar, 2020).

However, notwithstanding diverse endeavors, numerous local authorities encounter notable hurdles in attaining optimal administrative efficacy. The issues of bureaucratic regulations, malpractice, and insufficient institutional capability frequently pose primary barriers to the execution of legislative modifications (González, 2023; Nolan García & Aspinwall, 2019). This scenario mirrors the disparity between the aims of legislative alterations and the outcomes attained in practice, underscoring the necessity for more comprehensive investigations to grasp the elements impacting the triumph or downfall of legislative adjustments within the realm of administrative efficiency (Askim et al., 2010; Krogh, 2011).

Research examining the influence of legal changes on the operational effectiveness of local administrations has generated varied and often conflicting results. Several investigations indicate that legal modifications can enhance efficiency to a great extent by streamlining processes and reinforcing monitoring mechanisms (Brown, 2014; Guild, 2024; Hruschka, 2016). Conversely, alternative inquiries demonstrate that in the absence of sufficient institutional capacity reinforcement, legal adjustments do not consistently yield the anticipated enhancements (González, 2023;

McAlexander et al., 2023; Nakrošis et al., 2022). This gap in research underscores the critical necessity for a thorough literature review aimed at identifying trends and crucial elements that contribute to the success or lack thereof of legal reform.

Legal reforms are frequently met with opposition from bureaucrats who perceive a threat from the suggested alterations. This opposition may manifest as overt refusal, covert interference, or mere disregard for the updated regulations. The effectiveness of legal reforms in enhancing administrative efficacy is also contingent upon the capacity of local authorities to oversee transitions and construct alliances that endorse the enforcement of reforms (Dragu & Polborn, 2013; Neshkova & Kostadinova, 2012; Van Haelter et al., 2023).

This manuscript provides a distinctive contribution through the presentation of an all-encompassing literature review concerning the influence of legal restructuring on operational effectiveness within regional governance. In contrast to prior research, which tends to concentrate on specific instances, this paper amalgamates results from various investigations across diverse nations to offer a more comprehensive overview. Furthermore, this study will delve into pivotal elements that have not received widespread attention in previous scholarly works, such as the function of information technology in bolstering legal adjustments and operational effectiveness.

In the international sphere, certain nations have demonstrated notable achievements in enacting legal changes aimed at enhancing administrative effectiveness. Illustratively, South Korea and Singapore have effectively executed reforms targeting the digitization of public governance, leading to a substantial decrease in bureaucratic hurdles and enhanced openness (Chung et al., 2022;

Tskhadadze, 2024; Yukhno, 2024). Conversely, various countries like India and numerous nations in Africa have encountered considerable barriers in the implementation of legal modifications, primarily stemming from issues related to institutional capabilities and pervasive corruption.

This study will further investigate the involvement of international donors and non-governmental organizations in advancing legal transformation in developing nations. Frequently, initiatives propelled by global aid encounter obstacles to long-term viability once external backing is withdrawn. Thus, it is crucial to comprehend the methods through which legal modifications can be formulated to endure and flourish without excessive dependence on external assistance.

This article endeavors to examine the current body of literature concerning the influence of legal restructuring on administrative efficacy within municipal administrations. By conducting a methodical examination of prior research works, this article will assess the impact of alterations in the legal structure on administrative procedures, the effectiveness of public services, and the overall efficacy of municipal administrations. Emphasis will be placed on cross-national case studies to pinpoint trends and crucial elements that contribute to enhancements or deteriorations in administrative efficiency consequent to legal reform.

To accomplish these aims, the current investigation will seek to address the subsequent inquiries: (1) In what manner does legal modification impact the operational effectiveness within regional governance? (2) What are the principal elements that contribute to the prosperity or inadequacy of legal adjustment in enhancing operational effectiveness? Through the resolution of these inquiries, it is anticipated that this manuscript can

present a more thorough understanding of the function of legal modification in enhancing operational effectiveness within regional governance and propose pragmatic suggestions for policymakers and scholars in the time ahead.

Overall, it is anticipated that this research will address the existing literature gap and offer a substantial enhancement to our comprehension of the dynamics of legal reform and administrative efficacy. Furthermore, the objective of this paper is to present recommendations for policy formulation that can assist local government policymakers and practitioners in creating and executing legal reforms that are both efficient and enduring.

## RESEARCH METHODS

This research employs a conventional literature review methodology to analyze the influence of legal changes on the operational effectiveness within municipal administration (Rozas & Klein, 2010). Such a method enables scholars to gather, assess, and amalgamate current research findings, thereby offering a more thorough comprehension of the subject matter under examination (Fellows & Liu, 2021).

A thorough exploration of the existing literature was undertaken utilizing a variety of sources, notably prominent academic databases like Google Scholar, JSTOR, Scopus, and ProQuest. The search terms employed encompassed key phrases such as "legal reform," "administrative efficiency," "local government," and "administrative efficiency." Furthermore, to guarantee an extensive and all-encompassing scope, cross-referencing from identified articles was also employed during the literature review process.

The literature chosen for examination in this research was determined based on specific criteria for inclusion and exclusion. Inclusion criteria

encompass articles appearing in recognized and esteemed scientific journals, research focusing on the effects of legal modifications on operational efficacy within local governance, studies utilizing empirical or theoretical approaches, and articles released in both English and Indonesian. Conversely, exclusion criteria involve articles lacking direct relevance to the research subject, studies without verifiable empirical data or outcomes, and articles published prior to 2000 unless they offer substantial theoretical advancements.

Articles identified during the initial search were subjected to a screening process based on their titles and abstracts in order to ascertain their relevance to the research topic. Those articles that successfully passed the initial screening were then examined in their entirety to confirm compliance with the established inclusion criteria. The chosen articles were subsequently scrutinized to pinpoint essential themes, significant findings, and areas where the existing literature lacks coverage. Data extracted from a variety of studies were amalgamated to offer a more thorough understanding of how legal reform impacts the administrative efficiency of local government. This amalgamation process involved the integration of findings from different studies to recognize common trends, discrepancies in results, and critical factors influencing the outcomes of legal reforms.

## **RESULTS AND DISCUSSION**

### **Patterns and Trends from the Literature**

The examination of literature in this research uncovers various significant patterns and tendencies concerning the influence of legal restructuring on administrative effectiveness within municipal authorities (Andrews & Boyne, 2012; Deruytter & Bassens, 2021; Garrone et al., 2013; Le Blanc, 2006). A recurring trend is the notion that legal revisions emphasizing the streamlining of

administrative protocols and enhancing supervisory frameworks can notably enhance administrative efficiency (Tinkelman & Mankaney, 2007). Streamlining of protocols frequently entails the removal of redundant bureaucratic stages, which not only accelerates administrative procedures but also diminishes the likelihood of corrupt practices (Macfarlane & Looney, 2011; G. Wang et al., 2010).

Research demonstrates that enhancing transparency is a crucial component of effective legal restructuring. The promotion of transparency can be accomplished through diverse methods, such as the utilization of information technology, online dissemination of governmental data, and broadening public availability of public information (Hochstetter et al., 2023; Pacios & Cardama, 2023; Rafique et al., 2020). Measures aimed at enhancing transparency not only bolster governmental responsibility but also foster confidence in governmental establishments (Chiang et al., 2024; Guerrero-Gómez et al., 2021; Q. Wang & Guan, 2023). For instance, nations that have effectively integrated e-governance frameworks have exhibited notable enhancements in operational effectiveness and decreased instances of corruption.

Moreover, the engagement of the public in the process of legal reform is a significant trend that has been recognized in scholarly works. The involvement of the public not only enhances the credibility of the reforms but also guarantees that the proposed modifications align with the requirements and anticipations of society (Choudhury, 2014; Dempster et al., 2019). Numerous research works have emphasized that the outcomes of decision-making and implementation of reforms are more enduring and efficient when the community is actively engaged (Boothroyd et al., 2017; Schlechter et al., 2021). This

is attributed to the sense of ownership that the participating community feels towards the success of the reform.

Nevertheless, the literature indicates that bureaucratic resistance is a prevalent obstacle in the execution of legal modifications. Bureaucrats experiencing apprehension towards alterations are inclined to oppose reforms, whether overtly or via clandestine subversion (Abadi et al., 2024; Bauer, 2012; Bell et al., 2022). Such opposition has the potential to impede the execution of reforms and diminish the efficacy of proposed adjustments. Consequently, successful reforms typically entail change management initiatives encompassing training and enhancement of governmental personnel's capabilities to guarantee their preparedness for change.

Finally, robust political backing and leadership are highlighted as pivotal elements in the scholarly works. Legal changes, bolstered by unwavering political dedication from regional authorities, have a higher likelihood of triumphing over bureaucratic obstacles and navigating through implementation challenges. Forward-thinking and dedicated policymakers can have a crucial impact on resource mobilization, coalition formation, and the longevity of reform efforts. Moreover, effective leadership is essential for the consistent and sustainable implementation of reforms.

The patterns and trends highlighted in the literature underscore the significance of streamlining administrative processes, enhancing transparency, fostering public engagement, addressing bureaucratic opposition, and securing political backing for the efficacy of legal restructuring. These discoveries offer valuable perspectives for policymakers and scholars aiming to enhance administrative efficacy in municipal administrations via legal transformation.

## **Country Case Studies**

In the global context, variations in the success and challenges of implementing legal reforms are evident in case studies from different countries. The case of South Korea serves as a prominent illustration of successful legal reforms, primarily achieved through the digitalization of public administration (Chung et al., 2022; S.-B. Kim & Kim, 2020). By introducing an e-government system, the South Korean government enabled the delivery of public services online, leading to a considerable reduction in bureaucracy and enhanced transparency (S. Kim & Han, 2015). This endeavor was underpinned by a robust technological infrastructure and a significant level of political dedication, ensuring the implementation and sustainable maintenance of the reforms. The success of South Korea underscores how the synergy between information technology and strong political backing can markedly enhance administrative efficiency.

India, on the other hand, is encountering notable obstacles in its endeavors towards legal reformation. Despite attempts to rationalize administrative processes and enhance transparency, the efficacy of these reforms is obstructed by prevalent bureaucratic opposition and corruption (López-de-Silanes et al., 2002; Tang, 2017). The insufficient support from institutions and the political sphere further diminishes the government's capacity to execute proposed modifications successfully. Legal transformations in India encounter hindrances primarily due to a firmly established bureaucratic ethos, wherein public officials tend to oppose alterations that they perceive as jeopardizing the existing state of affairs. This scenario implies that in the absence of robust institutional and political backing and efficient strategies to surmount

bureaucratic opposition, the objectives of legal reforms are likely to remain unattained.

In the African context, challenges tend to be more intricate. Nigeria, for instance, has engaged in a series of legal reform initiatives to enhance administrative efficiency; however, it still grapples with significant hindrances like corruption, resource scarcity, and political volatility (Akorli & Adom, 2023; Olujobi et al., 2023). Despite the backing from global donors and non-governmental bodies to drive change, progress is often hindered by the complexities of the local environment. These instances underscore the need for tailored legal reforms encompassing capacity building, political endorsement, and persistent endeavors to combat corruption and bureaucratic opposition (Suberu, 2018; Trujillo et al., 2013). These cases underscore the vital role of contextual factors and adaptable implementation strategies in determining the success of legal reforms.

### **Key Factors for Success and Failure**

Numerous critical factors contributing to the success of legal reform initiatives can be pinpointed through the examination of literature and analysis of case studies. Initially, a robust institutional capacity emerges as a fundamental requirement. Nations that achieve positive outcomes in legal reform endeavors typically possess sufficient institutional framework, encompassing training programs and capacity enhancement for public sector personnel (Domorenok et al., 2021; McAlexander et al., 2023; Mulia, 2022; Ricks & Doner, 2021). Such training plays a vital role in fostering comprehension among employees and facilitating the effective implementation of proposed modifications. For instance, in the case of South Korea, extensive training initiatives focusing on utilizing information technology within public administration have empowered

government workers to swiftly acclimate to the e-government platform, consequently leading to substantial enhancements in administrative efficacy.

Secondly, robust political backing and effective leadership are crucial for success. Backed by unwavering political dedication from local authorities, legal changes have a higher likelihood of surmounting bureaucratic hurdles and addressing implementation challenges (Mulia & Putri, 2022; Zada et al., 2023). Forward-thinking leaders can have a pivotal impact on resource mobilization, coalition building, and the continuity of reform efforts. Singapore exemplifies how steadfast political dedication from the government in incorporating technology within public governance has led to notable enhancements in efficiency (Ho, 2017; Ng, 2018). Continuous political endorsement guarantees that reforms are implemented, sustained, and adjusted to meet evolving requirements.

However, numerous factors frequently contribute to the failure or hindrances in executing legal reform. One significant impediment is bureaucratic resistance, wherein officials resist changes due to perceived threats, leading to either overt opposition or covert interference. Effective change management is imperative to address this issue, including transparent communication regarding the advantages of reform and engaging employees in the planning and execution phases (Boon & Verhoest, 2018; Warrick, 2023). Moreover, pervasive corruption often poses a substantial barrier to the implementation of legal reform. Without robust anti-corruption measures, initiatives to enhance transparency and accountability are prone to falter. Furthermore, the lack of consistent political backing can derail reforms, diminish their impact, and ultimately result in failure. Experiences from India and various African nations highlight those

reforms lacking sufficient institutional and political support are prone to falling short of their objectives (Callais & Lawson, 2024).

Overall, the efficacy of legal reform in enhancing administrative effectiveness is significantly influenced by a confluence of variables, such as institutional capabilities, political backing, the integration of information technology, and the handling of bureaucratic opposition. To tackle these obstacles, a comprehensive and locally customized approach is imperative. Merely altering regulations is insufficient for the success of legal reform; it necessitates an execution plan that engages all parties involved, continuous support from political figures, and a dedication to eliminating corruption and bolstering institutional capabilities. Insights gleaned from global case studies underscore that prosperous legal reform stems from cooperative and flexible endeavors tailored to each nation's distinct challenges and opportunities.

## CONCLUSION

This research presents a thorough literature review concerning the influence of legal revisions on administrative efficacy within local administrations. Through the utilization of thematic examination and case studies spanning various nations, it has been observed that legal alterations emphasizing the simplification of administrative protocols, enhancement of transparency, and integration of information technology can notably enhance administrative efficiency. Robust political backing and sufficient institutional capability are pivotal for successfully executing legal modifications. Nevertheless, resistance from bureaucratic entities and prevalent corruption persist as substantial hurdles requiring resolution. These conclusions offer valuable perspectives for policymakers and scholars in formulating and executing more efficient and enduring legal transformations.

## LIMITATION

This research presents several constraints that necessitate acknowledgment. Initially, the limited availability of certain pertinent literature could potentially impact the extent of this examination. Certain studies of potential significance remained inaccessible due to restrictions related to subscriptions or expenses associated with access. Secondly, there is the possibility of publication bias, wherein studies displaying favorable outcomes are more inclined to be published than those exhibiting negative or inconsequential findings. Thirdly, disparities in regional and national settings might influence the applicability of the conclusions derived from the scrutinized studies, thus underscoring the need for a cautious interpretation of the outcomes within the specific milieu of each country or region. Lastly, the conventional approach to literature review employed in this investigation may not have encompassed all relevant studies, considering that certain studies may have eluded detection during the literature exploration process.

## IMPLICATION

The discoveries of this investigation hold numerous significant implications for policymakers and practitioners within local governance. Initially, to enhance operational effectiveness via legal adjustments, policymakers must guarantee sufficient institutional capability through training and education for public officials. This educational program should encompass proficiency in information technology, change management, and other competencies necessary to implement adjustments successfully. Subsequently, consistent political backing is crucial for surmounting bureaucratic opposition and ensuring the consistent execution of adjustments. Moreover, there should be a rise in the allocation of

resources towards information technology to bolster the digital transformation of public governance. Lastly, there should be an escalation in community engagement and openness in the adjustment process to foster public confidence and diminish corruption. By adopting a comprehensive strategy tailored to the specific local circumstances, legal adjustments can attain their desired objectives and benefit society.

Further investigation is required to delve into the enduring effects of legal modifications on administrative effectiveness and how cultural and social elements impact the efficacy of these modifications. Cross-national comparative analyses may offer more profound insights into the determinants influencing the outcomes of legal adjustments. Through an enhanced comprehension of these dynamics, there is an expectation that policymakers can formulate and execute legal modifications that are more efficient and sustainable, consequently enhancing administrative effectiveness within municipal administrations and yielding increased societal advantages.

## REFERENCES

- Abadi, D., Willem van Prooijen, J., Krouwel, A., & Fischer, A. H. (2024). Anti-establishment sentiments: realistic and symbolic threat appraisals predict populist attitudes and conspiracy mentality. *Cognition and Emotion*, 1–15.
- Akorli, C. D., & Adom, P. K. (2023). The role of corruption control and regulatory quality in energy efficiency transition tendencies in Africa. *Iscience*, 26(3).
- Andrews, R., & Boyne, G. (2012). Structural change and public service performance: The impact of the reorganization process in English local government. *Public Administration*, 90(2), 297–312.
- Askim, J., Christensen, T., Fimreite, A. L., & Laegreid, P. (2010). How to assess administrative reform? Investigating the adoption and preliminary impacts of the Norwegian welfare administration reform. *Public Administration*, 88(1), 232–246.
- Bauer, M. W. (2012). Tolerant, If Personal Goals Remain Unharmed: Explaining Supranational Bureaucrats' Attitudes to Organizational Change. *Governance*, 25(3), 485–510.
- Bell, E., Christensen, J., & Jessen Hansen, K. (2022). Resistance or capitulation? How discrete emotions shape citizens' interactions with the administrative state. *The American Review of Public Administration*, 52(8), 535–557.
- Boon, J., & Verhoest, K. (2018). On the dynamics of reform resistance: Why and how bureaucratic organizations resist shared service center reforms. *International Public Management Journal*, 21(4), 533–557.
- Boothroyd, R. I., Flint, A. Y., Lapid, A. M., Lyons, S., Jarboe, K. L., & Aldridge, W. A. (2017). Active involved community partnerships: co-creating implementation infrastructure for getting to and sustaining social impact. *Translational Behavioral Medicine*, 7(3), 467–477.
- Brown, D. K. (2014). The perverse effects of efficiency in criminal process. *Va. L. Rev.*, 100, 183.
- Callais, J., & Lawson, K. (2024). Underperforming reformers: Examining disappointing cases of economic reforms. *Kyklos*.
- Chiang, L., Tai, K.-T., & Lee, I. P. (2024). Compliance with COVID-19 preventive policies and governmental transparency: an experimental analysis. *Public Management Review*, 1–21.
- Choudhury, N. (2014). Legality and legitimacy of public involvement in infrastructure planning: observations from hydropower projects in India. *Journal of Environmental Planning and Management*, 57(2), 297–315.
- Chung, C.-S., Choi, H., & Cho, Y. (2022). Analysis of digital governance transition in South Korea: Focusing on the leadership of the president for



- government Innovation. *Journal of Open Innovation: Technology, Market, and Complexity*, 8(1), 2.
- Dempster, G., Sutherland, G., & Keogh, L. (2019). Public engagement for regulatory reform: a case study of autologous stem cell therapy regulation in Australia. *Science Communication*, 41(5), 527–551.
- Deruytter, L., & Bassens, D. (2021). The extended local state under financialized capitalism: Institutional bricolage and the use of intermunicipal companies to manage financial pressure. *International Journal of Urban and Regional Research*, 45(2), 232–248.
- Domorenok, E., Graziano, P., & Polverari, L. (2021). Introduction: Policy integration and institutional capacity: Theoretical, conceptual and empirical challenges. In *Policy and Society* (Vol. 40, Issue 1, pp. 1–18). Oxford University Press.
- Dragu, T., & Polborn, M. (2013). The administrative foundation of the rule of law. *The Journal of Politics*, 75(4), 1038–1050.
- Fellows, R. F., & Liu, A. M. M. (2021). *Research methods for construction*. John Wiley & Sons.
- Garrone, P., Grilli, L., & Rousseau, X. (2013). Management discretion and political interference in municipal enterprises. Evidence from Italian utilities. *Local Government Studies*, 39(4), 514–540.
- González, Y. M. (2023). Reforming to avoid reform: Strategic policy substitution and the reform gap in policing. *Perspectives on Politics*, 21(1), 59–77.
- Guerrero-Gómez, T., Navarro-Galera, A., & Ortiz-Rodríguez, D. (2021). Promoting online transparency to help achieve the Sustainable Development Goals: an empirical study of local governments in Latin America. *Sustainability*, 13(4), 1837.
- Guild, E. (2024). Frontex and access to justice: The need for effective monitoring mechanisms. *European Law Journal*.
- Ho, E. (2017). Smart subjects for a Smart Nation? Governing (smart) mentalities in Singapore. *Urban Studies*, 54(13), 3101–3118.
- Hochstetter, J., Vásquez, F., Diéguez, M., Bustamante, A., & Arango-López, J. (2023). Transparency and E-government in electronic public procurement as sustainable development. *Sustainability*, 15(5), 4672.
- Hruschka, C. (2016). Enhancing efficiency and fairness? The Commission proposal for a Dublin IV Regulation. *ERA Forum*, 17(4), 521–534.
- Karkin, N., & Janssen, M. (2020). Structural changes driven by e-petitioning technology: changing the relationship between the central government and local governments. *Information Technology for Development*, 26(4), 837–855.
- Kim, S.-B., & Kim, D. (2020). ICT implementation and its effect on public organizations: The case of digital customs and risk management in Korea. *Sustainability*, 12(8), 3421.
- Kim, S., & Han, C. (2015). Administrative reform in South Korea: New public management and the bureaucracy. *International Review of Administrative Sciences*, 81(4), 694–712.
- Krogh, S. (2011). Reform politics through the creation of inefficient political institutions: the case of the 2007 Danish administrative reform. *Scandinavian Political Studies*, 34(4), 307–331.
- Kysar, R. M. (2020). The New Tax Legislative and Regulatory Process. *National Tax Journal*, 73(4), 1135–1162.
- Le Blanc, M.-F. (2006). Two tales of municipal reorganization: Toronto's and Montreal's diverging paths toward regional governance and social sustainability. *Canadian Journal of Political Science/Revue Canadienne de Science Politique*, 39(3), 571–590.
- López-de-Silanes, F., Buscaglia, E., & Loayza, N. (2002). The Politics of Legal Reform [with Comments]. *Economía*,

2(2), 91–152.

- Macfarlane, P. A., & Looney, M. A. (2011). Expediting the institutional review board process for exercise protocols. *Research Quarterly for Exercise and Sport*, 82(1), 129–134.
- McAlexander, R. J., Yang, J., & Urpelainen, J. (2023). Political regime, institutional capacity, and inefficient policy: Evidence from gasoline subsidies. *Review of Policy Research*.
- Mulia, R. A. (2022). Systematic Literature Review: Analisis Tren dan Tantangan Dalam Perkembangan Desentralisasi di Indonesia. *Jurnal Ilmiah Ekotrans & Erudisi*, 2(2), 49–61. <https://doi.org/10.69989/528eg697>
- Mulia, R. A., & Putri, R. P. (2022). Pengaruh Tingkat Kemiskinan dan Produk Domestik Regional Bruto Terhadap Kesejahteraan Masyarakat. *Jurnal Ilmiah Ekotrans & Erudisi*, 2(1), 22–33.
- Mulia, R. A., & Saputra, N. (2020). Analisis Faktor-Faktor Yang Mempengaruhi Kesejahteraan Masyarakat Kota Padang. *Jurnal El-Riyasah*, 11(1), 67–83. <https://doi.org/10.24014/jel.v11i1.10069>
- Nakrošis, V., Dan, S., & Goštautaitė, R. (2022). The role of EU funding in EU member states: building administrative capacity to advance administrative reforms. *International Journal of Public Sector Management*, 36(1), 1–19.
- Neshkova, M. I., & Kostadinova, T. (2012). The effectiveness of administrative reform in new democracies. *Public Administration Review*, 72(3), 324–333.
- Ng, R. (2018). Cloud computing in Singapore: Key drivers and recommendations for a smart nation. *Politics and Governance*, 6(4), 39–47.
- Nolan Garcia, K. A., & Aspinwall, M. (2019). Restraining Gulliver: Institutional reform and the strengthening of state capacity and compliance. *Regulation & Governance*, 13(3), 321–339.
- Olujobi, O. J., Okorie, U. E., Olarinde, E. S., & Aina-Pelemo, A. D. (2023). Legal responses to energy security and sustainability in Nigeria's power sector amidst fossil fuel disruptions and low carbon energy transition. *Heliyon*, 9(7).
- Pacios, A. R., & Cardama, S. M. (2023). A comparison of public disclosure in archives and libraries using TransPa\_BA. *Profesional de La Información*, 32(1).
- Rafique, H., Wang, T., Lin, Q., & Singhani, A. (2020). Transparency promotion with model-agnostic linear competitors. *International Conference on Machine Learning*, 7898–7908.
- Ricks, J. I., & Doner, R. F. (2021). Getting institutions right: Matching institutional capacities to developmental tasks. *World Development*, 139, 105334.
- Rozas, L. W., & Klein, W. C. (2010). The value and purpose of the traditional qualitative literature review. *Journal of Evidence-Based Social Work*, 7(5), 387–399.
- Schlechter, C. R., Del Fiore, G., Lam, C. Y., Fernandez, M. E., Greene, T., Yack, M., Schulthies, S., Nelson, M., Bohner, C., & Pruhs, A. (2021). Application of community-engaged dissemination and implementation science to improve health equity. *Preventive Medicine Reports*, 24, 101620.
- Song, M., An, S.-H., & Meier, K. J. (2021). Quality standards, implementation autonomy, and citizen satisfaction with public services: cross-national evidence. *Public Management Review*, 23(6), 906–928.
- Suberu, R. T. (2018). Strategies for advancing anticorruption reform in Nigeria. *Daedalus*, 147(3), 184–201.
- Tang, Y. S. (2017). The International Politics of Legal Reforms: Hard Bilateralism, Soft Multilateralism and the World Bank's "Doing Business" Indicators. *Revista Brasileira de Política Internacional*, 60(1), e016.
- Tinkelman, D., & Mankaney, K. (2007). When is administrative efficiency associated with charitable donations?

*Nonprofit and Voluntary Sector Quarterly*, 36(1), 41–64.

- Trujillo, L., González, M. M., & Jiménez, J. L. (2013). An overview on the reform process of African ports. *Utilities Policy*, 25, 12–22.
- Tskhadadze, K. (2024). E-Government Implementation on the Example of Georgia. *TalTech Journal of European Studies*, 14(1), 253–270.
- Van Haelter, B., Vos, D., & Voets, J. (2023). Drivers of reform implementation in local government: a qualitative comparative analysis. *Public Money & Management*, 43(2), 174–182.
- Wang, G., Luo, T., Goodrich, M. T., Du, W., & Zhu, Z. (2010). Bureaucratic protocols for secure two-party sorting, selection, and permuting. *Proceedings of the 5th ACM Symposium on Information, Computer and Communications Security*, 226–237.
- Wang, Q., & Guan, Z. (2023). Can sunlight disperse mistrust? A meta-analysis of the effect of transparency on citizens' trust in government. *Journal of Public Administration Research and Theory*, 33(3), 453–467.
- Warrick, D. D. (2023). Revisiting resistance to change and how to manage it: What has been learned and what organizations need to do. *Business Horizons*, 66(4), 433–441.
- White, L. (2001). 'Effective governance' through complexity thinking and management science. *Systems Research and Behavioral Science: The Official Journal of the International Federation for Systems Research*, 18(3), 241–257.
- Yukhno, A. (2024). Digital transformation: Exploring big data governance in public administration. *Public Organization Review*, 24(1), 335–349.
- Zada, M., Khan, J., Saeed, I., Zada, S., & Jun, Z. Y. (2023). Linking public leadership with project management effectiveness: Mediating role of goal clarity and moderating role of top management support. *Heliyon*, 9(5).